I. Summary Results

The 10th Summit of the Central Ohio Compact (Compact) was held at The Fawcett Center at The Ohio State University on October 9, 2018. Compact leaders and speakers called this Summit an "inflection point," "our new collaborative" and "the new shared agenda for The Compact and the Central Ohio Region."

More than 250 leaders participated in the 4-hour discussion with about 25% of attendees new to the Summit. Compact leaders remain focused on the regional attainment rate of 65% of adults earning a postsecondary certificate or degree by 2025. Previous Summits showcased partnerships, policies and initiatives that support the Compact’s strategic principles: Aspiration and Access; Alignment and Academic Preparation; Alternative Pathways for Adult Learners; and Affordability.

As participants shared ideas, resources and program models, organizations from across various sectors wanted to know how they can address barriers to student success. It was clear a Summit was needed to bring groups across all sectors together to develop a common vision with goals. The 10th Summit was designed to respond to that challenge.

Many interested organizations strive to remove barriers, anticipate challenges and improve access when it comes to housing, nutrition, health, child care, transportation, and finances. Employers are committed in ensuring sources of skilled talent are continuously available. Employers are also examining how they can participate in informing early learning, K-12 and college curricula to build pathways that lead to living-wage careers.

Summit convener Columbus State Community College has roughly 26,000 students, many of which face multiple non-academic challenges that pose barriers towards their degree or credential completion, and affect their employment opportunities.
Central Ohio economic development leaders have said that the region must address issues such as income inequality if the area is to see the industry prospects and high-value job growth that is projected for the coming years. The October 9 Summit focused on cross-organization perspectives on poverty, economic mobility and barriers to completion of degrees and certificates. The Summit process revealed that a number of leadership and research-based organizations are closing in on frameworks for inclusiveness, human development and career advancement across all communities.

Participants contributed to small group discussions and offered post-Summit feedback that helped shape the Compact's future work. Their responses include:

- A desire for clear definitions and benchmarks, especially on matters of equity, inclusive economic development and underserved populations.
- A collective focus on equity and inclusive economic development is essential to success when it comes to regional priorities and planning.
- A shared dashboard on all of Central Ohio’s biggest challenges.
- Support for tools and resources to help citizens, cross-sector organizations and communities connect to an overarching framework for collaboration while understanding their own roles and accountabilities.

---

II. Agenda and Approach

The Summit agenda included the following steps:

1. **Welcome:** Bruce McPheron, Executive Vice President & Provost, The Ohio State University
   David Harrison, President, Columbus State Community College
2. **Business/Questions of the Day and the Use of a Summit Caucus:** Don Upton, Summit Moderator
3. **Updates from Partners and Program Participants:** Summit Participants
4. **Updates/Policy and Programs:** From the Ohio Department of Higher Education:
   Stephanie Davidson, Vice Chancellor, Academic Affairs;
   Paula Compton, Associate Vice Chancellor, Executive Director;
   Candice Grant, Director of Ohio Guaranteed Transfer Pathways
5. **Recalibrating the Journey - Background on the Compact, and Responding to Calls for Focus on Equity and Cross-sector Achievements:** Dr. Harrison
6. **Regional Data Review and the Equity Imperative:** From the United Way of Central Ohio:
   Lisa Courtice, President & CEO;
7. **The Path Forward**
   - **Inclusive Economic Development, Columbus 2020:**
     Kenny McDonald, President & Chief Economic Officer, Columbus 2020
   - **A Flourishing Framework for Community Well-Being:**
     Doug Kridler, President & CEO, and Heather Tsavaris, The Columbus Foundation
8. **Critical Questions/Small Group Discussions and Responses:** Summit Attendees
9. **From Consensus-to-Action:** Summit Caucus
10. **Results and Next Steps:** Dr. Harrison and Upton
11. **Adjourn:** Dr. Harrison
The agenda was prepared with six overarching objectives in mind:

- Provide perspectives on inclusive economic development, equity and income inequality from a range of thought leaders and organizations
- Use data and maps to illustrate cross-organization similarities and gaps and show "how people are living their lives today"
- Consider approaches and models that illustrate how cross-sector, equity-focused collaboration may influence economic mobility
- Test and find ways to resolve differences in language, measurement and focus
- Use reactions, insights and recommendations from participants to shape a working agenda and expectations for regional collaboration
- Publish Summit Notes and ensure access to the day’s presentations as a resource for further discussion

### III. Progress/Status Notes

Summit agendas include a period for brief updates and progress reports. The 10th Summit included updates on the Central Ohio Workforce Advisory Council from Educational Services Center (ESC) Superintendent Tom Goodney; Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways and College Credit Plus from Ohio Department of Higher Education leaders; and the U.S. Department of Education’s Investing in Innovation Fund grant from Steve Dackin, Columbus State’s Superintendent of Schools and Community Partnerships.

**Tom Goodney on the Central Ohio Workforce Advisory Council:** It also serves as the workforce advisory component of the Compact. The ESC will look to local school district superintendents to bring insights from their communities and employer contacts into subsequent meetings. Next meetings will be Nov. 28, 2018; Feb. 20 and April 10, 2019. Council goals include: advising school districts on economic changes and the job market; setting out employment skills most critical to business success; and helping shape career-relevant programming/coursework and teacher/advisory access to industry. The ESC is committed to fostering a regional strategy that links districts to many businesses.

**Ohio Department of Higher Education leaders on Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways and College Credit Plus:** The Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways statutory requirement is intended to drive seamlessness, cost-effectiveness and participation across Ohio’s communities. There is a commitment to student advising and partnerships. Key language from Section 3333.16(C) Ohio Revised Code includes:

\[...\] any associate degree offered at a state institution of higher education may be transferred and applied to a bachelor degree program in an equivalent field at any other state institution of higher education without unnecessary duplication or institutional barriers. The policies and procedures shall ensure that each transferred associate degree applies to the student’s degree objective in the same manner as equivalent coursework completed by the student at the receiving institution.

Ohio has 36 public institutions of higher education. About 36,000 students transfer each year, saving close to $80 million thanks to the Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways program. It is proving to be a low-cost pathway. One of the important parts of student success is high quality pathways and we need a stronger commitment. Advising is so important. We want to empower our advisors and our school counselors with the information. Smooth transitions from high school to college are also critical. In line with this Summit’s focus on non-academic barriers, the Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways program addresses students’ fiscal challenges in completing college.

For College Credit Plus, we should make sure all students can participate. For newcomers to the program and its core objective:

Ohio’s College Credit Plus can help you earn college and high school credits at the same time by taking college courses from higher education institutions. The program is designed to promote rigorous academic pursuits and to provide
a wide variety of options to college-ready students. https://www.ohiohighered.org/ccp
To make this possible for underserved students and communities, we need schools to provide as much data as possible when requested to track demographic information such as race, ethnicity and socio-economic status. Over the past two years, economically disadvantaged students make up about 50% of CCP’s 7th-12th grade population. Here is an equity challenge and an opportunity for big improvement. The ability to show a student is college-ready is a key factor, so we have a program waiver process when it comes to the College Credit Plus requirements. This is a way we intend to shape our work for underserved populations. Once the waiver opportunity was published, 18 programs were approved that serve small groups to very large student communities.

Steve Dackin on the Investing in Innovation Fund grant: As an example of how partnerships through grants allow for innovation and leaps in student success, Dackin shared a progress report on the grant project called the Central Ohio Partnership for College and Career Readiness Expansion. According to the U.S. Department of Education:

IV. Orientation to the Compact and the Call for a Summit on Equity and Regional Collaboration

Dr. Harrison said the Ohio Guarantee Transfer Pathways and College Credit Plus programs open the door to understanding and taking action on the equity problem. “Guaranteed transfer pathways are a big deal,” he said. “We’ve made great progress, but we have a long way to go.”
When it comes to student debt, Ohio is in bottom 5th of the U.S. and a high percentage of students in higher education come through transfer pathways. “Time is not our friend in this regard,” he said.

Dr. Harrison believes this is an important inflection point for Central Ohio and the state. "It is an opportunity to explore how we are looking forward for at least the next 10 years."
The previous Summit served as an update on Compact strategy. So far, participants have seen positive results on engaging employers. Partners continue to use the Compact’s eight strategies for success.¹

The purpose of this program is to provide competitive grants to applicants with a record of improving student achievement and attainment in order to expand the implementation of, and investment in, innovative practices that are demonstrated to have an impact on improving student achievement or student growth, closing achievement gaps, decreasing dropout rates, increasing high school graduation rates, or increasing college enrollment and completion rates. https://www2.ed.gov/programs/innovation/index.html

Goals of the Central Ohio Partnership for College and Career Readiness Expansion include:
* At least 10,000 students served in partner school districts
* At least a 5% reduction in dropout rates
* At least a 5% increase in students taking and passing college courses
* At least 90% of students graduating with college credits by the end of the grant

The Central Ohio Partnership for College and Career Readiness Expansion serves seven school districts with high percentages of low-income families. The increase of students enrolled in college courses from 2016-17 to 2017-18 in those districts include: Whitehall City Schools: 94%; Groveport Madison Schools: 77%; Hamilton Local Schools: 165%; South-Western City Schools: 64%; and Columbus City Schools: 43%.

¹ Central Ohio Compact Collective Purpose:
1. Increase the number of students earning postsecondary credentials;
2. Ensure all college-bound students graduate college ready;
3. Increase the number of high school students graduate with credits toward degree or certificate;
4. Increase bachelor’s degree attainment of community college students through guaranteed Preferred Pathways;
5. Provide consistent & accurate communication with students and families to eliminate uncertainty;
6. Implement targeted success strategies for working adults, low-income and first-generation students, and students of color;
7. Advance the region’s need for a highly skilled workforce by aligning workforce and economic development efforts;
8. Manage the cost of education through dual enrollment, 2+2 and 3+1 bachelor’s degree programs, shared facilities, and integrated planning.
high school. More work needs to be done in communicating with students and families. There is good, early progress with alignment between employers and the region’s economic development efforts. In 2012, we codified our commitment with our first strategy document where Summit participants adopted the 60% goal. JP Morgan Chase was an early investor in operational capabilities. Later, Ohio updated the degree and credential goal to 65%. How credentials are being measured has changed. When we started, it was difficult to measure anything less than an associate degree. Now, we can look at the details and drive the recognition that shorter-term credentials are going to become more and more important as we help people and employers respond to economic and technological change and work with agility.

We have some strong momentum with regard to employer alignment with our work. We put together a workforce advisory council that has been a game changer in a lot of ways. We are having frequent conversations with chief talent officers at some of our bigger companies and gaining a much better understanding of how each other does business.

Data is at the forefront of what we are doing. We need to learn how interventions are impacting students differently by working with disaggregate data. At the center of this Summit is a recognition that is shared by leaders in all sectors in our region: Barriers to student success may not be academic ... there is a collective path. We need knowledge of what non-academic barriers our students are faced. In turn, organizations with resources to serve struggling students are excited about sharing their data, strategies and ideas.

“How fragile student situations are in order to earn credentials”, Dr. Harrison said. “Every college president in this room … if they don’t have a food pantry, they are working on one.”

V. United Way and Thrive

Lisa Courtice from the United Way of Central Ohio provided a summary of research and collaborative approach.

The United Way commitment serves the most vulnerable in our community. For past five years, pathways out of poverty has focused on four priority areas/buckets:

- **Neighborhoods**
  - Home value
  - Poverty rate
  - Vacancy rate
  - Foreclosures
  - Cost-burdened households

- **Jobs + Access**
  - Transit access
  - Commute time
  - Job access
  - Unemployment
  - Job growth

- **Health + Safety**
  - Medically underserved
  - Primary care providers
  - Incarceration rate

- **Education**
  - Student poverty
  - School performance
  - Educational attainment
  - Student attendance

The United Way shared opportunity maps from The Kirwan Institute for the Study of Race and Ethnicity. Opportunity mapping is a research tool used to understand the dynamics of “opportunity” within metropolitan areas. The purpose of opportunity mapping is to illustrate where opportunity rich communities exist (and assess who has access to these communities) and to understand what needs to be remedied in opportunity poor communities. (http://kirwaninstitute.osu.edu)

**OPPORTUNITY MAPPING | THE KIRWAN INSTITUTE**

**Thrive is a movement among leading executives of organizations on the front line serving people in poverty ... Our community and our region would really benefit from having a goal where we all could align and reduce poverty.**

Lisa Courtice

This provides a compelling illustration of opportunity. Based on an opportunity map of Franklin County, Courtice noted that opportunity is about where we are born and continue to live. The economy is not working for everyone. We should consider
as a cross-sector leadership team: What happens when growth slows or a recession occurs? Research indicates white residents enjoy the greatest level of prosperity but for African-American and Hispanics, the strong central economy is producing equally poor results. Children of color tend to live in economic isolation. A quarter of all children are growing up in poverty in Franklin County. Poverty rate nearly doubles for those who’ve dropped out of high school. Using Franklin County data, here’s a look at poverty rates for specific populations:

- Poverty Rate: White 10.8%; Asian 20.1%; Hispanic or Latino 30.6%; African-American 27.3%
- Poverty Rate, by age: Under Age 5 –23.5%; 18 to 64 – 14.6%; 65 and older – 10.1%
- Poverty Rate, by educational attainment level: Bachelor’s Degree – 4.4%; High School Graduate – 16.9%; Less than High School 31.1%

Matt Habash, President and CEO at Mid-Ohio Foodbank, talked about how and why the community needs to work together in new ways:

- As many as 80 million jobs will disappear in the U.S. because of a variety of technological and economic forces.
- We need a new way of working and this is what Thrive is trying to suggest … One of the challenges we have in the non-profit world is we work in silos … We’re coming together as a group called Thrive 2.0.
- How do we collectively, as a community, come together to effect the change and create a place where everyone has an opportunity to thrive?
- Our goal is around improving economic mobility. The measure of success - income goes up. We need a strategy that raises awareness of the jobs and skills of the future.
- We can’t take a priority approach when it comes to various barriers and issues. A collective look on how we can support each other is required.

VI. Inclusive Economic Development and a Flourishing Community

Leaders with Columbus 2020 and The Columbus Foundation shared their organizations’ commitment to collaboration, equity and economic mobility. Kenny McDonald, CEO of Columbus 2020, talked about inclusive economic development while Doug Kridler, president and CEO of The Columbus Foundation, unveiled their work on the Flourishing Framework. These two discussions set the stage for small-group discussions focused on overlapping agendas, common language and a shared dashboard.

Kenny McDonald, on key points about Central Ohio as Columbus 2020 builds a strategy for the next decade

Central Ohio is:

- The fastest private job growth among top 10 Midwest metros and 17th among top U.S. metros
- The fastest population growth
- Top performer in real GDP growth
- Top ten among U.S. metros in millennial (25-34) population

The Columbus 2020 regional economic development assessment and analysis sets out four key Columbus regional narratives:

- Disruption is coming / Disruption is here.
- We have unrealized innovation capacity.

Global connectivity must increase.
Sustaining economic momentum is critical.

McDonald emphasized that automation could threaten tens of thousands of jobs in several leading industries in the region. The occupations most at-risk include automotive & transportation and manufacturing.

Emerging global forces will have a profound impact on the region’s leading industries. These industries encompass nearly all of the region’s largest companies and most of its fastest-growing private and venture-backed firms.

He also noted the Columbus region benefits from a diverse economy that has enjoyed broad-based growth in recent years. At the same time, employment is heavily weighted toward big companies.

Data on income inequality is drawing leader, industry and economic development professionals’ attention to new strategies and partnerships. “In Columbus, the top 20% of households accounted for nearly half of all regional income in 2016,” McDonald said.
Summit participants can consider the following as emerging priorities over the next decade:

- Pursue Regional Growth
- Attract Impactful Investment
- Realize Innovation Capacity
- Maximize Individual Opportunity

A new strategy that embraces inclusive economic development must focus on jobs that pay a living wage, wage growth, poverty rate among employed individuals, and median household income. Columbus 2020 will play a role in preparing communities for success by helping align community and economic development strategies as well as workforce strategies in anticipation of disruptive economic and technological forces and career pathways.

Doug Kridler and Heather Tsavaris, on the The Columbus Foundation’s “Flourishing Framework” project

Kridler and Tsavaris started their presentation with an Amartya Sen quote:

*Economic growth without investment in human development is unsustainable and unethical.*

The Columbus Foundation is focusing on the attributes and measures of a flourishing community using four inquiries:

A. What is the best way to measure community flourishing?
B. Do conditions exist in Columbus to enable residents to flourish?
C. How could promotion of flourishing become central to the work of the Columbus Foundation?
D. How could diverse stakeholders work together to improve flourishing across the city?

The Columbus Foundation is dealing with these inquiries by:

- Identifying international community best practices that have successfully launched and sustained community-wide flourishing efforts.
- Establishing a Columbus-specific framework that enables the coordination of the Foundation’s work to optimize physical, social and emotional factors that contribute to individual wellbeing and flourishing communities.

Here are some practices and policies that are especially informative for the Central Ohio region:

- **Santa Monica, Calif.**: Local government partnership with RAND sought to define well-being for Santa Monica.
- **Austin, Texas**: Community dashboard developed by non-profit with 25 community partners. Simplified index uses only four dimensions gathered from objective data (safety and engagement; basic needs; health and full potential).
- **United Kingdom**: An index identifies society inequalities and drives policy change to mitigate them. National level index implemented by Cameron government in 2010; currently maintained by Office for National Statistics. Measures societal and personal well-being using objective and subjective measures. Data indicates discrepancy in well-being for different age groups.

Summit participants envisioned their personal, organizational and collaborative roles in a Flourishing Framework specific to Central Ohio.

(Graphic viewed on the next page)
Dr. Harrison moderated a discussion with Kenny McDonald and Doug Kridler on a vision of Central Ohio for the next decade.

**McDonald, on inclusive economic development**

"We represent 11 counties and 29 cities, rural communities, urban communities, suburbs, exurbs ... Not only have we not brought every citizen along on this journey where we have more prosperity, but we have not brought every community along ... I do hear a louder voice though about 'we can do that better' ... if I really look at the numbers, nobody’s doing that. A lot of people can go win but how they win is important. The results in capacities we build to get not just people along but whole communities along is really important."

**Kridler said research on the Flourishing Framework is needed. His thoughts on authenticity through citizen engagement:**

"Do the research but also take the citizens voices and have their choices determine what it is that is meaningful, different and distinguishable about our community.

There is an appetite for leadership ... and we are happy to accept our small role in that. But at the same time, we need to be reflective of and create a sense of ownership of something like the Flourishing Framework within rooms like this, not as a mandate ..."

**McDonald, on equity and inclusive economic development**

The success of this region will equal its ambition ... Physically we can grow ... The markets are all at our doorstep. But our ambition has to include these other things. It is to move some of these numbers we have not been able to move as we would like.

I will tell you that more and more of the companies are asking us about what we are talking about in this room.

We have to be integrated if we’re going to succeed and compete.

**Dr. Harrison: This alignment of human development and economic development is not happening in most places.**

"We've got a moment in time to have these conversations in an authentic way. Imagine if we had these regional principles that Columbus State uses as a start for its strategic plan ... that the Mid-Ohio Foodbank or the United Way uses as their starting point for their strategic plan. That the new governor uses as a starting point for the new administration."
VII. Small Work Groups and Summary Results

Participants met in small work groups to respond to presentations and challenges. Because of the depth of comments and suggestions, the complete, raw results are set out in the Attachment to these Summit Notes.

The groups worked at tables for approximately 25% of the Summit and responded to three pages of written inquiries. They followed up with discussions on equity, inclusive economic development, poverty and the collaborative power of The Central Ohio Compact.

Summary results and recommendations include:

A. Participants reported a strong understanding of the concept of equity.

B. Participants need a better understanding of inclusive economic development.

C. Participants asked for the following communication follow-ups: clarity of definitions; understanding of the benchmarks and metrics associated with key terms; roles of key groups, professionals and organizations can play in inclusive economic development; purposeful engagement of the citizenry; clarity on what holds the community back from measurable progress/confront barriers; diverse communicators to help and support the complex communities and businesses of the region, simple and clear language, and a framework for tracking progress; common language for the under-served populations we are targeting; and methods for each organization to relate to an overarching framework and each other.

D. Participants agreed that a collective focus on equity and inclusive economic development is essential to success when it comes to regional priorities and planning.

E. Participants said the best measures of access and attainment should include: income educational attainment; success factors for specific underserved populations; employment for in-demand, high-value career pathways; removal of transportation barriers; use of “opportunity mapping” as discussed in the Summit; housing; healthcare and healthy communities.

F. Participants strongly support using a shared dashboard on all of Central Ohio’s biggest challenges, with recommendations for: cross-sector agreements and roles; transparency; utilization and integration of existing research and data resources; care when confronting competing dashboards; mutually agreed-upon goals; ease-of-utilization and access; pathways for root cause analyses; public showings of progress and failures/honest assessments; macro and micro KPIs; and clear roles and accountabilities.

VIII. Resources

Key Presentations, Geo-spatial Data and Trends - [client will provide special link in their final edits]

The Central Ohio Compact/Background/Reports/Summits
http://centralohiocompact.org/

Columbus 2020 -
https://columbusregion.com/columbus-2020/

The Columbus Foundation -
https://columbusfoundation.org/
Small Group / Table Discussions

Organization of the Raw Feedback:

Groups worked at tables for approximately 25% of the Summit and responded to three pages of written inquiries.

Small group discussions followed presentations on equity, inclusive economic development, poverty and the collaborative power of The Central Ohio Compact.

The written responses are organized by page and sub-part questions.

Written feedback has been transferred into text with a commitment to reflect the emphases, spacing and unique organization of the results of each table.

Trending and highlights of overlapping messages and expectations are found in the Summit Notes.

A summary of the plenary discussion of small group work is found in the Summit Notes.
Question – How Do You Rate Your Understanding of Concept of Equity?

1 = No Understanding  to  5 = Working or Expert Knowledge
Average Table Scores – 4, 3, 2.5, 4, 3, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4

Question – How Do You Rate Your Understanding of the Concept of Inclusive Economic Development?

1=No Understanding to 5=Working or Expert Knowledge
Average Table Scores – 4, 2, 4, 2, 3.5, 3, 2.5, 3, 3, 2, 3.1, 3.4, 2, 2.4, 2, 2, 2, 2, 2, 3.5

What Follow-ups, Approaches or Next Steps are Needed in Communications?

This general understanding helps to point to the need of a dashboard to help inform (do a deeper dive) for a more understanding

Definitions
Elements of Equity & Inclusive Economic Development
Empowerment Tools
Levers of Equity
Context of Equity

Standard definition of equity in this context ➔ CLEARLY defined, very specific
From there, identifying standard metrics
Develop a robust communication plan/strategy
Using the dashboard to take action

What do we mean re: inclusive – able to be equity-focused on economic development or proportional data metrics
The definitions from one site to another (workplace, college, high school, etc.)
There isn’t a one size definition/answer for all constituents
What happens when industry demands more of the lower wage workers than the ones with more educational attainment – or when the parameters of “fit” for job placement doesn’t fit the demographics of our communities where poverty rates are higher

Better understanding of what role K-12 plays in inclusive economic development

Common definition of Equity - Data, Tracking, Baseline - All defining definition now
For economic development, not clear what the plan is – Don’t understand mechanism to get there/Need shared understanding, strategic planning and communication
Equity in relationship to what?

CONCEPT OF INCLUSIVE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

- Simple understanding of main targets
- Action steps
- How do partners continue to work together beyond the summit? “In between the meetings”
- Logistically how do we do this – the structure
  - Work groups
  - Identify areas of focus
  - Bringing it back together

Diversity across the board being at the table and having a voice

Translated support materials for schools to counter anti-equity conversation/white privilege

Tools for counselors

Purposeful engagement of the actual people (teachers, parents, students) by schools/Columbus 2020 and Community Foundation

Accept our own status quo & move to action

Common terminology around equity + inclusive economic development

Clear intent is design of plan to include those in poverty/underserved

Help us understand inclusive economic development

Move info on alignment of human development to economic development

How do we include everyone in the conversation – Are they informed and engaged during the process?

Avoid “building it and they will come” scenario

Big picture

Definition

Contextualization of these terms within the region

Contextualization for each sector – Educated business

Continued information & communication

How do we reach beyond this audience to daily lives of people?

What holds us back – What are our current barriers?

- Speed/rate of change
- Technology
- K12 perspective – How we develop programming is out-of-synch with the needed rate of change

Who needs to be involved?

Challenge – creating persistent conduit to create future vision & therefore preparation
Intentionality
Greater discussions about everyday barriers and wrap-around services
Include individuals and organizations who are directly working with underserved communities

Common vocabulary
Common expectations
Defining the communities to be included
What do they actually look like?
What is the connection between the two, i.e. ven diagram
Because of the transitions in technology, how do we prepare students not just for the second job – but when the next job is not so obvious
What skills and thinking strategies are we teaching to younger children?
How to address hunger, health, homelessness/housing affordability, poverty, transportation for both education and jobs

Education, people on the population in this room talk – Inclusive conversation
National + International showcase
More discussion on the topics today
When areas gain economically where will the people go who cannot afford higher rates
More information on drivers of equity & barriers to equity
Make sure the right people are at the table
Develop uncomplicated language to address solutions

Define the target (diverse) audience(s)
This requires engaging individual communities (grassroots), not boardrooms
Needs a diverse set of communicators. Example – Consider a map of opportunities
Empower local groups to identify problems / opportunities for solutions that fit their needs
- Process for this could be shared … Framework with a regular cadre of meetings + timeline
- How do we 1) communicate outcomes
- 2) measure what is working
- 3) connect to larger framework?

Depends on the sender of the message
Common definition on who is the “underserved population” we are targeting
More complex than traditional categories & data sets so we need to dig deeper
Inclusive Economic Development – means “opportunity & access”
Removing bias from programs
We need research. We don’t know what gaps are. How do we measure gaps or prioritize?

Case studies of cities good but not the whole picture of a city
Economic growth measured but not human growth
Who are the missing players of human growth or where the rubber meets the road
Define economic development for education
What about graduates of high school – More than (4-year) college
Moving from concept to reality
Do business & industries worry about inclusive economic development
Educate the businesses. Employer’s responsibility.
Can we educate a student to show up at a job & learn what to do with no instructions?

Community partnerships
Envision IT training + implement in K12
Chamber of Commerce – getting people to the table
How do we provide equity for individuals (trauma, economic, etc?)

1. Identify the audience ➔ personas
2. Define the terms in 2-3 sentences - tailoring to audiences
3. What does it mean across perspectives?
4. Talk with people not just to people ➔ people need to personalize it
5. Use visuals – Slides, maps shown today were powerful
6. Identify ways to expose a broader audience to this information
   Boots on the ground
   Webpage helps but we need the conversation
   Need community development emphasis over gentrification

EQUITY – Who is not understanding equity and how do we connect with them; Greater distinction between equity & equality
Continued benchmarking
More engagement toward an understanding of inclusive economic development
Continued support around barriers (food, housing, transportation) to allow for opportunities to increase financial standings

Clearer definition of what inclusive economic development is related to, i.e. what are the attainable next steps?
What is the holistic vision?
How does the individual contributor make an impact in concrete terms (whether institution, company, individual, etc.)
How Important is our Collective Focus on Equity & Inclusive Economic Development in informing the Regional Priorities and Planning?

1 = Not Important At All  to  5 = Essential to Success

Average Table Scores – 4, 5, 5, 4.5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 3.5, 4.5

Why and What Should the Measures be to Impact Access & Attainment?

It is important – as to the number of children living in poverty today – that is the potential workforce of our future and we must find ways to make a difference – or the challenges of talent pipeline of the future.

Again – the need for the dashboard

To impact, we need to know what needs to be impacted
To know how things are connected
Common language & tools between sectors
Identify the goal (the end in-mind)
  + What are the steps to get to the goal

↑ income for low income households
Educational attainment (and how that is defined/what’s included
access to higher ed through high schools (keep up momentum, reach targeted populations to give them a head start toward attainment)
% improvement in access/attainment for targeted/underrepresented populations
Employment in meaningful, high-quality, in-demand career pathways
Benchmarking against similar communities

Without a collective focus – we work in silos that promote inequitable and non-inclusive practices
What is the cause for the current situation? Why aren’t we examining the current systems & why the gaps exist?
All the inclusive practice & equity to education has direct exclusions by tests/cut scores that keep them out. Why are the gate keepers still excluding students?
Definitions
How to deal with the economic & other barriers?
Transportation barriers in Central Ohio

We understand its purpose, but the challenge is connecting “inclusive economic development” to our daily work

Based on data – Poverty level rising – How will people take care of their needs?
Cities that engaged saw greater impact – Engagement matters
Measures: high quality early learning success – transportation – wherewithal of parents – don’t lower standards

16
Why?
Current … impact for community who is already accessing large % of population who is left out
What?
• -Opportunity Maps
• -Continuing to disaggregate data – by educational setting – by industry – as a whole!

Wealth gap is continuing to widen. Untapped opportunity for many (30%)
Indicators are changing the hard demographic data to reduce poverty rates
Follow reduced lunch/waiver programs and dependency
Outcomes of underrepresented completers
Engagement numbers (movement of numbers)
Drive up 2year degree completions
Improve GED/High School Diploma numbers + Certificate completions
Utilization of College Credit Plus/Access by underserved populations/Help parents/Community know value & removes barriers for families to access
Support system awareness + access where none exists
Demystifying stereotype of career techs, community college and provide clear tie to personal/economic gain

400,000 residents that can’t meet their basic needs. Hard to believe but it’s true.
Nursing and technology are the only sectors that pay a living/housing wage
Engagement: Convincing struggling families to make a change is more challenging than expected
You can’t be what you can’t see

Economic development measures cited this morning
Equitable access – opportunities for all – equitable success is the measure
Monitor discrepancies in achievement & attainment
Knowledge of goals across sectors
Reporting challenges – Opt out of some indicators
Disaggregated data
Knowing the “why” behind the numbers
Lack of knowledge about how to leverage high school opportunity after high school
Ensuring that each initial college course experience is a great one
Communication and assessment of that communication
Value proposition attached to “why” – always
Affordability → Currently pay more for less on rentals
Expanded transportation
Expansion of homeless shelters that are accessible
Connected transportation from neighborhoods to workforce
Cost of childcare

Where are the public funding strategies? What role does the private sector play in the future?
Funding should be built into everything we do
When developing new systems, how do we include every group without needing waivers for exceptions
How do you move money to the right spot and award programs that will really meet the most inclusive targets?

Business needs to be included
We need to work together
This is important, crisis point. Not occurring in other parts of the state
The explosion of poverty pockets is startling
Gap is widening – Remove barriers for all including parents
Goal with end in-mind & steps to get there
Engagement matters
Parents

Why?:
If we don’t it imperils everything
Wellbeing and sense of purpose are important to measure
Robots, etc. are demeaning our purpose
Progress should be for everyone not just a few
Need to facilitate the dialogue
Need to elevate the discussion
Be honest about what the data are showing (not just in the best light)
Measures:
Need new measures
We want the maps to be all the same color
Need better measure of social mobility
How do we define the Columbus we want to be
High school graduation and dropout rates
What are we doing as a society
Incarceration measures
Early leaning / Parent education / Early Intervention
Why?
Data is clear on this
Measures?
What we already have – Central Ohio Compact dashboard, Geo-spatial Metrics on Income and Employment, United Way Needs?
Longitudinal tracking of k12 to higher education to jobs (income)
  - Communicating process + outcomes to those in system (hope)
Per capita income
Using Kerwin data to drive outreach to areas of low opportunity
Look at the total population & pull in appropriate community partners
  Build trust and understand the culture of neighborhoods
  Do not lose momentum & maintain momentum
How do we measure integrated partnerships (perhaps more qualitative) v. transactional partnerships (very easy – for example, the number of students)
Graduation Data
Sub-groups – graduation rates
Credentials at graduation
Graduating high school with college credit
Success rates after graduation (college graduation – job)
SEL & Mental health supports available
Early intervention – highly-trained instructors

Collective Focus is rated a “5” by our table but this is our opinion but don’t believe the larger community sees it this way
  • perspective
  • awareness
Wage growth, full employment
Progression through levels of poverty
Opportunity without access is nothing
  • Need to measure access
    - transportation
    - education
    - employment
    - housing
Need to have increased awareness of opportunities / access large set-aside for low income housing
Achievement gaps in education
Social service overlays
Healthcare
Childcare
Criminal justice system / greater impact on minorities
Housing / Affordable housing
High school outcomes – success rates
Educational readiness

Page 3 of Small Group Worksheet

Question – Do You Support Using a Shared Dashboard on our Region’s Biggest Challenges?

YES; YES; Yes, with a specific agreed upon purpose to help us identify action steps; YES; YES; YES (if we use it and don’t filter it!); YES; YES! (collaborative approach to identify biggest challenges); What does this mean? What’s on the dashboard?) Current dashboard – YES (Are there multiple measures defined for each sector?); YES (but drill-down of information is useful); YES (get out of the silos!); YES (to have a holistic approach, ensure honest use of data, common definitions, hold accountable); YES; YES; YES (of course); YES (if it is pulled from EMIS or other data source already created + not more work for the school district); (Different organizations are measured on different criteria that may not align on a larger level; publicly-available measures lend accountability that helps coordinate the work of non-profits); Agreed (YES) (avoid individual focus, does sharing dashboard complicate it more; can provide directions around needs)

Question - If You Support the Concept of Sharing, What Will it Take to Build Accountabilities Across the Public, Private and Non-profit (Independent Sectors)?

The stakeholders must agree that directionally connect is the way to proceed forward.
Outcome measures must be indisputable, concrete and objective to avoid the issues of individuals not address in the issues … the pitfalls of no action
The outcome measures must be applied to factors of positivity to the community at-large

Common Language
Transparency
Marco-KPSs (agreed between sectors) – Metrics
Technology
Agreement of “How to Define Success”
Micro KPIs that build to Macro KPSs – by sectors
Transportation – i.e. holistic approach
Needs a steward, someone to manage

Commonalities between data, ensure we’re speaking the same language
- Technology infrastructure to support it
- Available resources
- Make it as public/transparency as possible
- Create a work-based learning opportunity by leveraging existing students/data curricula

Partnerships with industry (locally) to support the initiative

The purpose and accountability for the data is clear. We believe in benchmarking progress for defined outcomes. The dashboard doesn’t currently directly impact students & their progress – more systems practice measures are currently reported. Need to include more qualitative information regarding current youth – can we include what they want / what they need from their viewpoint to monitor progress forward?

The available resources in the dashboard are not student-focused or parent-focused – They are not currently focused to engage or promote the understanding/access opportunities available. Information from the dashboards are constantly interpreted by the ones “in power” and then filtered to the students/parents. This enables the system to continuously filter/propose what they want to promote; not necessarily what students/families need – allows the system to perpetuate itself rather than be disrupted.

Competing dashboards

Policies that create right incentives, shared ownership
Ensure this isn’t “flavor of the year” – How to embed/energizes who we are as a community, impacts all of us. It’s not us v. them.

Mutually agreed-upon goals

Misnomers – Educational components to dispel myths

Intersections to know each other

Role clarity – we can’t al do everything

Community summer projects – acknowledge barriers & target them

Educate parents but not wait for them

Don’t wait until high school – as students get older we start to divide & categorize
65% of students have been exposed to trauma. Educators are not prepared to deal with this.

Continual conversation

Access to Data
- easy to get to (not labor intensive)
- technology system that supports it

Willingness to be open to sharing our data … even if it’s ugly
Personal data, student data, business data, ability to track from student ID to SS# seamlessly

Common terminology
Clear goals, intentional outcomes
Use data to address specific communities and change the access. Address the local (neighborhood) issue to support their inclusion. Each student.
Analyze jobless rate/unemployment by neighborhood and build solutions/access with employers and schools to intentionally address this
High school credits for working (in public/private partnerships)
Parents and students who are not wanting/needing college degree
Provide access to work-skill training in the neighborhood
Recognize the density map and the “why” behind it
Data for grands, national comparison/benchmarking

What are the biggest challenges

Value of sharing data
  • Build trust
  • Establishing common data points
  • Healthcare could be a model on data sharing results in a community identifier
  • How do we create the conditions to improve the lives of those unable to meet basic needs?
  • How do we navigate the benefits cliff – We need a benefits slope
  • Institutional and structural designs that keep people in poverty. Evaluate.
  • Why is there a pipeline to poverty? How/why/when do people get trapped in this pipeline and can’t get off. 1/3 of the population gets sucked into this vortex?

Clear goals
Meaningful data with purpose
Has to include communication with all stakeholders
The further down the chain we are, the easier it is to lose touch with goals – all need to stay connected

Root cause analyses, communicate to each sector on ow they can think out of the box
Eliminate “we’ve always done it that way” mentality
Shared buy-in v. mandated buy-in
Greater collaboration between organizations at board and strategy levels as well as “boots on the ground”
Our community leaders (government, private, non-profit) are critical to creating such dashboards & accountability across the board

Forced collaboration

Dashboard: Can be sued? to help education. Can there be just a simple few indicators for human development and economic development?

How do we communicate to the much broader and inclusive community (not just community leaders) – Whether through a dashboard or other methods?

How does a dashboard make individuals believe they live in a community that cares about them?!

Common definitions; data center (sharing); common goals;

Public showing of either progress or failure

Implicit bias training

Need a place / Governing structure to house the data

Someone to own the goals and data

Establish norms & expectations to share + compare data to help all grow

How do we create a dashboard that is accessible to all?

• Framework for communication around data and the dashboard alone is not enough
• Are there key communicators that can be trained, have access to data and create communications to calibrate the discussions and inclusivity?

Trust / Buy-in

Start small & build on needs to go beyond “compliance”

An understanding that every district is different and starting at different places

Many school scorecards are a representation of what is or is not occurring at kitchen tables

Common vocabulary of data. Dashboard. Still need to define with it is and how it should be used.

State needs to rethink private-public institutions, i.e. students who transfer to private schools

Accountability – commitment to doing better, honesty. Humility.

Trust. (Transparency)

Need to set aside competition

Keep in-mind the values of individual worth & bettering the community

Be careful with what you put on your dashboard

- create improvement not just change

Measurements matter

What is to be measured must be meaningful

Need for intense, hands-on contact
Accountability depends on resources, size
Macro & Micro KPIs
Shared ownership
Embed in our work

How do we follow / track students after graduation?
Start with shared understanding of community goals to bring alignment – Use shared goals to translate to accountabilities in various sectors (Kenny McDonald’s point during a Summit discussion)
Need to be willing and have the courage to share the bad news – Need organizations to be willing to be honest/public
Need mechanism to share out
Focus to lift underperforming rather than condemn/disparage

Align the resources to ensure achievement
Creating structure for support based on dashboard
Accessibility of input and output along with visibility
Shared ownership to solve problems
Clear definitions of data