SUMMIT NOTES

I. Summary Results

Over 250 regional leaders gathered for the ninth Central Ohio Compact Summit, with the priority of re-setting regional gatherings from traditional spring meetings to fall annual meetings. The repositioned meetings will look forward each year to shape the coming year of work.

The Summit was designed to work in three overarching segments:

- discussion of socio-demographic trends, competitive challenges and areas for reform (socio-demographic segment);
- sharing insights on the current and future hiring, retention and growth practices of employers (employer practices); and
- gathering perspectives and counsel from all participants through small group discussions, and discovering common priorities (small group feedback).

As a result, the Summit produced areas for action, learning and development. It produced a detailed record of small group discussions between and among all participants, which is identified as Small Group Work Sessions: Discussion and Action Plan Development/ Raw Notes by Table. Summary results of small group work are included in these Notes and include: design and release of a 2017-18 calendar of roundtables and smaller problem-solving events to respond to Summit priorities; support of reforms to the dual credit program called College Credit Plus; and a roster of employer/education partnerships that deal with career awareness, workplace experience, and access to and success in higher education. The Summit served to escalate awareness of key socio-demographic trends and the changing expectations of incumbent and future employers in the region.

The region’s Workforce Advisory Council, a multi-sector panel of senior human resource professionals, launched its approach to utilizing Summits to test and refine its program of work. This included drawing in feedback on how to transform general concerns about soft skill deficits to specific criteria that drives curriculum, career-seeker engagement, and employer success.
Background on the Purpose and Scale of The Central Ohio Compact for Newcomers –

Led by Columbus State Community College, the Central Ohio Compact is a partnership among K-12, higher education and economic development leaders committed to a big goal for our community: WE ASPIRE TO REACH THE 65% MARK FOR POST-SECONDARY DEGREE OR CERTIFICATE ATTAINMENT IN OUR REGION BY THE YEAR 2025. To date, the Compact includes 60 K-12 partners, 11 colleges and universities, 15 public sector partners, and over 150 industry partners covering an 11-county market.

II. Summit Agenda

The Summit agenda was designed to guide expert speakers and participants through the three stages of work (socio-demographic; employer practices; and small group feedback), with flexibility to identify new opportunities and raise difficult questions. The Compact Steering Committee desired a “roadmap” for discussion that required candor about community data and performance of key projects. The Committee also wanted to be sure a growing cohort of regional leaders confront the competitive opportunities and changing employer expectations seen through the region’s champion of job, brand and business growth, Columbus 2020.

Participants in the spring Summit of 2017 also expressed strong expectations that lengthy periods of time be dedicated to discussion. These expectations were addressed through dedicating over 30% of the Summit agenda to discussion.

The published agenda included:

1. Welcome 8:15 a.m.
   David Harrison, President, Columbus State

2. Business of the Day
   Don Upton, President, Fairfield Index, Inc.

3. Examining Impact of Trends on the Central Ohio Workforce
   - Understanding the Impact of Current & Future Regional Demographics: David Harrison
   - College Credit Plus: Results & Reforms: Stephanie Davidson, Vice Chancellor, Ohio Department of Higher Education
   - A Statewide Update
     Ryan Burgess, Director Governor’s Office of Workforce Transformation
   - Regional Prosperity & Economic Competitiveness
     Kenny McDonald, CEO, Columbus 2020
     Tim Harman, Director Customized Workforce Recruitment & Training, Columbus 2020
   - Plenary Discussions & Questions

4. Seeking & Securing Talent for Today and Preparing for Tomorrow
   - Marlene Lesko, Manager Talent Acquisition, Battelle
   - Ann Miller, Director Talent Acquisition, OhioHealth
   - Tom Poole, SVP, Talent Acquisition Manager, Huntington Bank

5. Small Group Work Sessions: Discussion & Action Plan Development

6. Small Group Report-out & Group Discussion

7. Results & Next Steps

8. Adjourn Noon
III. Business of the Day

Summit moderator, Don Upton, asked all participants to view the event as a whole rather than in individual, stand-alone elements. Participants were presented with principles to engage with experts and peers every step of the way, including:

- **Search for Improvements in Existing Programs and Practices**
- **Evaluate Areas where Existing Work or Targets May be Accelerated**
- **Learn About Key Trends and Challenges and Address them with Candor**
- **Honor Prior Summits, but Following up on Recommendations and Expectations**

As for the direct, shared roles of participants, the following responsibilities were set out:

- **Reposition Summits to Fall Events** and Look Forward to a Year of Work
- **Orient Newcomers**
- **Ensure a Bias for Action and Results**
- **Learn About and Consider the Current and Changing Needs of Our Employers and Sectors**
- **Identify Projects and Initiatives where We Can Accelerate and Improve Our Work**
- **Ensure More Time for Conversation and Problem Solving**
- **Demand Candor on Trends, Opportunities and Challenges**

IV. College Credit Plus, State and Regional Cooperation, and Key Socio-economic Trends and Opportunities

**Opening Context**

This agenda item sets the stage for identifying areas for improvement and reform, while helping regional leaders confront and respond to socio-economic and competitive data. Columbus State College’s President, Dave Harrison kicked off the discussion by sharing information on growth, poverty and impediments to the Compact’s 65% goal.

Key trends on overall growth and capacity include:

- Population growth since 2010 is about 140,000 people.
- 72% of all growth in Central Ohio was in Franklin County, and 16% was in Delaware County; no other county had more than 5%.
- Only Franklin and Delaware had increase in their “Under-18” populations; the rest declined.
- The fastest growing age group is “Over 65” which grew by 26%.
- 49% of the population is “Under 35” and 24% of the population is “Under 18”.

When looking at the limited population growth in the state, it is important to consider the fact that Central Ohio is experiencing positive net migration and immigration. Harrison said, “More than half (55%) of our net migration
since 2010 is international, which is approximately 35,000 international residents.” Concentrations of Asian, African, and Latino residents live in the northwest, north/north-east, and western areas of Franklin county. Foreign-born residents are more likely to live in multi-family and/or rental housing.

Harrison called participants’ attention to income inequality in the region and made specific reference to the Columbus Dispatch’s March 19, 2017 article “Income Inequality: Despite thriving economy, many in central Ohio struggle in low-wage jobs, Dividing Lines reveal income inequality in Columbus”. Harrison said, “The divide is clear.”

“The divide is clear,” Harrison said.

He identified “four troubling trends”:

- Columbus is among the most economically segregated cities in the country
- Unemployment is 4.6%, yet the share of residents are working poor. One in 3 live at or below 200% of the poverty line, which is now $49,200 a year for a family of four
- Columbus is among the least-promising places in the nation for low-income children who only have a 4.9% chance of reaching the top fifth of household incomes by age 30

Harrison called on Summit participants to explore how, in the face of low in-region population growth and a variety of equity barriers, the region should think and do things differently.

**Doing Things Differently – A Look at College Credit Plus and Dual Enrollment Objectives**

Vice Chancellor Stephanie Davidson briefed participants on College Credit Plus, a dual enrollment program that aligns with the Compact goals. She noted that Ohio postsecondary attainment goals included a focus on access, affordability, and timely completion.

While dual/concurrent enrollment was identified as a key strategy to support the attainment goals, participation in 2015 was consistently less than 5% of the potential pool of public high school students—with minority and low-income student participation rates even lower.

According to Davidson, the Chancellor of Higher Education set four key program principles:

- Focus should be on students not school districts or colleges
- School districts and colleges are expected to work collaboratively for student success
- The program should be structured to ensure access to all college-ready students with minimal need for students and families to contribute resources
- A priority of the program is to increase the participation rates of underrepresented and low income students

College Credit Plus replaced other dual enrollment programs beginning 2015-2016. Key principles include:

- Expand participation among all demographic groups
- Create a transparent funding system with equitably shared costs between school districts and colleges
- Ensure purposeful and meaningful coursework
- Ensure effective communication to parents and students
- Collect, report and track data related to participation and program outcomes

The commitment to tracking and reporting outcomes has led to this critical time for thinking differently about dual credit policy and improving the work. Year-one data shows over 54,000 students participated; and higher engagement included 23 Public Community Colleges, 13 Public Universities, and 35 Private Institutions. A closer look into participation indicates some opportunity for improvement. For instance, 72.5% of participants were in grades 11 and 12, and 71.6% were Caucasian (73% of HS population). Only 6.3% were African American (16% of HS population) and 2.6% Hispanic (4.5% of HS population). Over 14% were free and reduced lunch students (45% of HS). Davidson indicated that improvements are being
made in two categories. Stakeholder meetings underway for two new College Credit Plus rules for 2018-2019 school year: course eligibility and underperforming students.

**State, Region and Local Collaboration/Governor’s Office of Workforce Transformation**

Director Ryan Burgess briefed participants on the power of state-to-employer partnerships, and curriculum to apprenticeships. He outlined the field of vision Ohio has when it comes to employer needs, industry trends and shaping policies to provide students with access to career experiences and jobs. He said, “We are now aligning College Credit Plus with recognized pre-apprenticeship programs. We’re building a pathway for young people that gives them a lot of options – on-ramps and off-ramps to move into a good job.”

The Governor’s Office of Workforce Transformation has had a consistent presence in the Summit environment to ensure policy alignment, the drawing up of regional data and opportunities to state-level context and action, and the extension of impacts across industry/employer sectors that extend to multiple regions.

Burgess said that, when it comes to workforce, the state has three budget priorities:

- Connecting business and education
- Creating a culture of continuous learning
- Building career pathways

Burgess outlined eight programs and priorities that have particular affinity with the Central Ohio agenda:

- Regional Workforce Collaboration Model
- In-Demand Jobs Week
- OhioMeansJobs - Readiness Seal
- Workforce Supply Tool
- Aligning Recognized Pre-apprenticeship with College Credit Plus
- Business Advisory Councils
- IT & Cybersecurity Pathways
- Revolving Loan Fund and Prioritization of In-demand Programs

These are potential areas for further briefings and future Summit discussions.

**Columbus 2020: Regional Prosperity, Economic Competitiveness and Challenging Trends**

Kenny McDonald, President & Chief Economic Officer, Columbus 2020, provided a regional view of the future based on economic trends, the role of his organization, and expectations of global employers. He emphasized that the Central Ohio region has a critical scale and complexity in terms of its 11 counties, 29 cities, 85 villages, and 186 townships. In the midst of a highly competitive market, the region is surpassing capital investment, net new jobs, and per capita income growth goals. For context, 2017 performance includes:

- 53 announced projects, including:
  - 40 Expansion/retention … and
  - 13 Attraction, with
    - $1.29 billion invested,
    - 3,696 new direct jobs, and
    - an average wage of $48,732

McDonald looked to industry confidence in Central Ohio through the current decade by citing 745 company expansions and over 45,000 direct jobs. The average reported salary among all startups exceeds $84,000.

He asked that Summit participants take special note of Central Ohio’s benchmark strength when compared with 34 peer metropolitan areas in the U.S. This includes leading performance in GDP growth, private sector net new jobs, and labor participation rate (See Attachment A for McDonald’s benchmark data). Columbus 2020 also pays special attention to the sources and industry identities of its project pipelines. For instance, 41% of projects are from manufacturing, and 28% are from headquarters and business services. Of all Central Ohio projects, 49% are from foreign-owned companies.

From both a private sector and overall population growth perspective, Columbus is leading the Midwest. Columbus has landed in the Top-10 on a national scale, competing with San Francisco, Denver and Austin, in attracting Millennials.

(See Attachments B and C for growth and Millennial data points, respectively).
Tim Harman, Columbus 2020’s director of Customized Workforce Recruitment and Training, turned participants’ attention to the current assumptions and limitations that need to be addressed if Central Ohio is to bridge equity gaps and step up to the talent needs of 21st century employers. He reminded leaders that Millennials choose where they want to live and then decide on an employer as residents. He indicated the U.S. Labor force is growing at a lower rate than previous decade, with more retirees than starts. The rise of artificial intelligence and automation are shifting the employment roles, requiring continuous refreshing of skills. Also, employers nationwide continue to call attention to a skills gap.

Harman shared notable regional workforce trends:

- There is an aging workforce but this group is not retiring. This is an opportunity for reskilling.
- The opioid epidemic needs to be addressed and this requires direct community engagement.
- Automation, electric vehicles, alternative energy sources, logistics, technology data centers are all increasing in demand and requiring evolving skills.
- There is a construction boom across region, so attention to the skilled trades is needed.
- Refugee population growth is an asset but requires engagement in a cultural plan and programs like ESL.

When reviewing data and listening to Columbus 2020 clients, the regional skills gap includes:

- Middle level IT talent with more than 700 job postings but less than 350 graduates within last year.
- Vocational Skilled Trades which includes Electrical, HVAC, Plumbing, Welding, Construction. Customer Service/Call Center - Over 1,000 jobs created in the Columbus region this year.
- Logistics – Over 1,000 jobs created in the Columbus region within the past 12 months.

Harman sees a number of pathways and partnerships are required to move forward and remove barriers to prosperity. He highlighted the importance of growing relationships with companies and trade associations, and gathering more current data on talent performance and employment forecasts. Consistent with the interests of the Compact, Columbus 2020 encourages deeper, career-connected relationships with K-12 and, by extension, guidance counselors. He said much more needs to be done with hands-on learning, exposure to the workplace and class experiences tied to real-life applications.

Employers understand and value stackable certifications. They also value seamlessness of transfer credits into two and four-year degree programs, and encourage the ability of students/employees to “start, stop, complete, and start again”. The partnership with parents, families and caregivers matters even more as counselors share degree and career pathways at critical points in the K-12 experience.

Leveraging an Engaged Regional Workforce Advisory Group

The Workforce Advisory Council is a team of expert human resource professionals, who are associated with the region’s leading employers and representative of a number of growth sectors. The Council’s purpose statement includes the language: […] work with partner and peers to anticipate infrastructure, program, and policy needs. They represent a wide spectrum of industry sectors across the region. Its call to action is consistent with the trends set out by the Columbus 2020 team:

Central Ohio employers face a talent shortage as a result of a series of issues:

- A declining population of recent graduates and those entering the workforce for the first time as well as a large number of under-skilled or under-employed adults
- A population of workers who are not getting trained in high-demand fields.
- If this “perfect storm” is not addressed, the region’s employment gap will only worsen.

The Council will be focusing on several high-impact projects over the coming months, including building a talent pool for Central Ohio’s high growth industries, and developing education and training in information technology. Dr. Harrison provided the Council’s draft regional workforce strategy to Summit participants and requested edits, updates and “red-line” suggestions. Council members are

1 Members of the Workforce Advisory Council include: Dave Ames, DHL; Matt Backiewicz, Dawson Careers; Chad Delligatti, InnoSource; Drew Gordon, Big Lots Stores, Inc.; Tim Harman, Columbus 2020; Cheryl Hay, JobsOhio; Jerry Hutchinson, Abbott; Thomas Jessop, DSW Inc.; Marlene Lesko, Battelle; Scot McLemore, Honda of America; Ann Miller, Ohio Health; Rocky Parker, Nationwide; Jen Rohrbacher, Worthington Industries; Darren Shepard, American Electric Power; Suzanne Sinclair, State Auto; Justin Smith, LBrands; Tom Poole, Huntington Bank; Mohan Viddam, Halcyon Solutions, Inc.; Kelly Wilson, Cardinal Health; Joseph Wohrer, Alliance Data; Judy Yost, Chase
particular interest in feedback on how to translate generic calls for soft skills to specific, documentable steps. They will also play a role in shaping opportunities to share data and learn based on Summit feedback.

V. Seeking and Securing Talent for Today and Preparing for Tomorrow – Insights from Human Resource Experts

A panel of human resource and talent experts addressed Summit participants, sharing information on the changing landscape of talent acquisition and retention. They included: Marlene Lesko, Manager, Talent Acquisition, Battelle; Ann Miller, director, Talent Acquisition, OhioHealth; and Tom Poole, Senior Vice President, Talent Acquisition Manager, Huntington Bank.

The 30-minute panel discussion allowed for responses to the trends and challenges presented by Columbus 2020.

Some noteworthy insights include:

- Each organization represented on the panel continues to deal with a lack of general understanding of the nature, economic value and diversity of careers in their industries.
- Where high school completion may have been a (table) stake for some employment opportunities in the past, today’s needs are always “high school plus”.
- The function and discipline of “talent acquisition” needs to be re-considered in terms of the long-term growth of employees and their ability to move, succeed and contribute in an organization. The work needs to be redefined as “talent management”, requiring more data on employee aspirations, training and performance.
- Tuition reimbursement, with a “talent management” mindset, should move from being defined as a “benefit” to an “investment” in retention and mutual success.
- The demographic challenges of the region – i.e. not enough internal population growth to meet the opportunity to grow jobs, companies and capital – place pressure on area resident industries to think creatively about ensuring access to outstanding employees over time. Population growth trends are a problem but not a problem companies can help solve by:
  - building stronger partnerships with K-12 and higher education partners;
  - finding avenues to market the strength of their companies’ careers;
  - creating alliances with industry peers to strengthen foundational curriculum;
  - focusing more-and-more on employee growth and intra-company mobility;
  - providing access to workplaces and applied problem-solving;
  - identifying overarching training which strengthens and protects the company (such as the anti-money laundering training supported by Huntington);
  - strengthening the overall profile of STEM education in the region; and
  - supporting the Compact’s agenda items related to increasing college participation and completion across all communities.
- Discover the best avenues to share short and long-term staffing and skills outlooks through the education continuum, and ensure companies are participating in a meaningful feedback loop when it comes to calibrating the student experience with workplace success.
- Share detail with educators and students on how ongoing electronic postings and applications are managed, and how candidate information is evaluated at the start of the search process.
VI. Small Group Work

The 250 Summit participants were divided into small groups to provide reactions to regional trends, help prioritize the work for the next twelve months, and rethinking current projects. To guide discussions, the groups were provided with 5 questions:

Question #1 – What are your reactions to the economic and demographic trends?

Question #2 – Where and how can we accelerate our work as a team as we tackle these trends?

Question #3 – What was new to you when it comes to employment/hiring/recruitment practices?

Question #4 – Based on today’s information on our region’s economic competitiveness, how can we ready ourselves on the curriculum, talent, guidance and training fronts to be a best destination for critical business operations and headquarters?

Question #5 – Are there additional areas of work or data, which will help the Compact make progress?

Question #1 – Economic and Demographic Trends

Dominate area of concern/interest:

- Addressing underserved populations early in secondary education.
- Creating understanding of pathways to credentials, degrees and career.
- Call for communication strategies that reach parents, caregivers and students:
  Focus on career awareness, and deliver workplace experiences at appropriate times through the K-12 continuum.
  Personize communications, guidance and support to meet students and families where they reside, with appreciation for their unique, work/life/health history and communications needs.
  Focus on exposing teachers and counselors to career connections, workplace cultures and talent management strategies of businesses.
  Make labor market information understandable/accessible for all stakeholders.

- The talent deficit and inability to naturally grow our way into a deeper pool of talent is being taken very seriously. This requires strategic focus on race, socio-economic gaps, and first generation college-goers. It also includes a commitment to opportunities for new Americans.
- Connect students with hiring experts early.
- Reach the adult market of under- and un-employed, and veterans with skills aligned to employer needs.
- Translate the “soft skills” deficit into tangible, measurable attributes – Shift from the vague term to a portfolio of values labeled as “employee agility”.
- Discover ways to build on Columbus’s unique Midwest standing as a destination for Millennials.

Question #2 – Accelerating our Work

Leaders identify promising tactics:

- Use work-based problem-solving, learning and applications/Experiential learning.
- Expose students to real workplaces.
- Increase career awareness training and experiences for teachers, counselors and students. Provide a clear explanation of why the steps on the pathway to a career matter.
- Develop career success plan for every student.
- Create understandable pathways for students, parents and caregivers.
- Point instruction towards in-demand industries.
- Provide a clear understanding of what jobs will look like so students are pointed towards “career proficiency”.
- Bolster the limited talent pool with the aging workforce by meeting “Boomers” in the context of their careers, locations and communications channels.
- Find ways, with feedback from employers, to make “soft skills” specific and something that may be documented in a transcript, applications and on-the-job assessments.
- Develop internships that are calibrated to employer needs, key industries and curriculum, with special attention to under-represented students – Increase in opportunities for internships.
- Establish a “growth mindset”.
- Continue to build partnerships between education and business/employers, but drive to the specifics of skills, agility and problem-solving – Employers will not only give advice but confirm outcomes in the workplace.
Question #3 – New Information on Employment Practices

Dominate area of interest/concern:

- Listening to employers regarding agility and ensuring a powerful feedback loop with businesses.
- The growing interest in retention and development of talent – As one speaker said: We are moving from talent acquisition to talent management. We are moving from a recitative search for talent to a strategic, long-term decision.
- The power businesses can provide educators by identifying the elements of “agility”, and rewarding persistence.
- Reinforce that we will have a series of careers and points where we confront change driven by productivity, artificial intelligence, automation and new competition – HR experts may be playing a new role in guiding talent through these changes.
- There is a great deal teachers, counselors and students can learn about automated/electronic talent acquisition systems … and then apply to coaching and curriculum.
- We should think of ALL talent acquisition processes as requiring “high school diploma plus” – This means additional credentials or degree and/or workplace and real-life, documented problem-solving experiences.
- Students need experiences to help form career decisions.
- Teachers and counselors need training in company hiring practices.

Question #4 – Readiness to Compete

Focus on “agility”, and school and employer assessment tools for the specifics of “soft skills” – Create problem-solvers and analytical thinkers who are recognized as such by employers.

- Constant contact and verification with industry.
- Teacher and counselor exposure to workplaces, methodologies of talent searches and acquisition, and how curriculum is actually applied to solve business problems.
- Coordination of engagements with employers so that dozens of districts and centers of higher education are not duplicating efforts.
- A new approach to parent, family and caregiver engagement that meets them on the terms of their own lives with clear language, useful tools, and encouraging outcomes.
- Make a five-year employer outlook a standard for curriculum and workplace exposure.
- Seek alignment from what businesses value in terms of certifications and what is approved and recognized by the Ohio Department of Education.
- Ensure the region is addressing transit/multi-modal transportation issues that impede access to education and training, and the workplace.

Question #5 – Additional Areas for Work

Transitioning veterans, the opioid crisis and College Credit Plus reforms

- Support reforms in College Credit Plus and drive the information into middle school. Include an awareness campaign.
- Be intentional about the role of transitioning military in filling the skills/talent gap in Central Ohio.
- Clarify the connection between the opioid crisis; and joblessness and the talent deficit.

VII. Next Steps – The Next 12 Months of Work

The full, raw transcription of small group responses, organized by table, will be posted to the Compact website as a key next step.

The following will be recommended for the next 12 months of work:

A. Develop a set of roundtables and learning sessions that address Compact priorities, and publish a calendar to ensure robust participation. Areas of special interest include: data; productive and efficient business engagement; training in talent acquisition and management practices; career awareness programming; and employer-aligned attributes of an “agile” problem-solver.

B. Provide Summit results to the Workforce Advisory Council, with emphasis on shifting from the generalities of “soft skills” to specific roles of employers and educators.

C. Support of College Credit Plus reforms.

D. Roll-up of the coming 12 months for a fall 2018 annual meeting/Summit.

E. Post small group responses from the 2017 Summit.
**PROGRESS IN CONTEXT**

The Columbus Region economy continues to perform strongly. Here, the Columbus MSA is compared against 34 similarly sized metros generally within 1 to 3 million in population.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metric</th>
<th>Columbus MSA Ranking</th>
<th>National Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unemployment Rate</strong></td>
<td>4.2%</td>
<td>Denver (2.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment Growth</strong></td>
<td>1.5%</td>
<td>Portland (4.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Per Capita Income</strong></td>
<td>$46,570</td>
<td>San Jose ($81,592)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, 2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Poverty Rate</strong></td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>Salt Lake City (9.1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Community Survey, 2016 1-year estimates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GDP Growth</strong></td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>San Jose (46.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, 2010-2016</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Private Sector Net New Jobs</strong></td>
<td>19,900</td>
<td>Orlando (38,800)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Labor Participation Rate</strong></td>
<td>67.7%</td>
<td>Salt Lake City (71.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Community Survey, 2016 1-year estimates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Performance Key**

- **Top 10 Metros**
- **Middle 10 Metros**
- **Bottom 10 Metros**
## FASTEST GROWTH IN THE MIDWEST

### Private sector job growth, 2010 to 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Columbus</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indianapolis</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minneapolis</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milwaukee</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Population growth, 2010 to 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Columbus</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indianapolis</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minneapolis</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kansas City</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati</td>
<td>1.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milwaukee</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Louis</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh</td>
<td>-0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>-0.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Bureau of Labor Statistics, State and Area Employment; U.S. Census Bureau, Population Estimates
TOP 10 IN U.S. FOR MILLENNIALS

Percent of population age 25 to 34, large metro areas (1M+ population)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Austin</td>
<td>17.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salt Lake City</td>
<td>16.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Diego</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seattle</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denver</td>
<td>16.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Francisco</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia Beach</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Columbus</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Orleans</td>
<td>15.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey 2015